



**City Commission Meeting - Budget Related
City Hall, Commission Chambers, 3rd Floor, 1700 Convention Center Drive
September 10, 2015**

Mayor Philip Levine - Absent
Vice-Mayor Edward L. Tobin
Commissioner Michael Grieco
Commissioner Joy Malakoff
Commissioner Micky Steinberg
Commissioner Deede Weithorn
Commissioner Jonah Wolfson

City Manager Jimmy L. Morales
City Attorney Raul J. Aguila
City Clerk Rafael E. Granada

Visit us at www.miamibeachfl.gov for agendas and video streaming of City Commission Meetings.

ATTENTION ALL LOBBYISTS

Chapter 2, Article VII, Division 3 of the City Code of Miami Beach, entitled "Lobbyists," requires the registration of all lobbyists with the City Clerk prior to engaging in any lobbying activity with the City Commission, any City Board or Committee, or any personnel as defined in the subject Code sections. Copies of the City Code sections on lobbyists laws are available in the Office of the City Clerk. Questions regarding the provisions of the Code should be directed to the Office of the City Attorney.

To request this material in alternate format, sign language interpreter (five-day notice required), information on access for persons with disabilities, and/or any accommodation to review any document or participate in any city-sponsored proceedings, call 305.604.2489 and select 1 for English or 2 for Spanish, then option 6; TTY users may call via 711 (Florida Relay Service).

In order to ensure adequate public consideration, if necessary, the Mayor and City Commission may move any agenda item to an alternate meeting date. In addition, the Mayor and City Commission may, at their discretion, adjourn the Commission Meeting without reaching all agenda items.

Vice-Mayor Tobin called the meeting to order at 5:05:09 p.m.

SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIAL 1:

R5C Ordinance

REGULAR AGENDA**R5 - Ordinances****5:06:04 p.m.**

R5A An Ordinance Amending Ordinance No. 1605, The Unclassified Employees Salary Ordinance Of The City Of Miami Beach, Florida, As Follows: Providing For The Classifications In Group VII, Comprised Of At-Will Employees Commonly Referred To As "Unclassified Employees"; Revising The Pay Range For The City Manager And The City Attorney To Reflect The 3 Percent Cost Of Living Adjustment That Went Into Effect October 1, 2014; Adjusting The Pay Range For The Assistant Director-Public Works, Auditor, Tax Auditor, Asset Manager, Assistant Director-Human Resources, Construction Manager, Management And Budget Analyst, Agenda Coordinator, Transportation Manager And Financial Analyst; Establishing The Following Newly Created Classifications: Assistant To The City Attorney, CAO Paralegal Specialist, Beach Maintenance Director, Administrative Officer-City Manager's Officer, Administrative Officer-Planning Department, Assistant Emergency Management Director, Capital Projects Director For The Convention Center District, Assistant Director-Parking Services Compliance, Employee Benefits Manager, Fire Administrative Services Manager, Greenspace Division Director, Fire Inspection Supervisor, Fire Communications Manager, Procurement Contracting Analyst, Streets And Street Lighting Superintendent, Parks And Recreation Projects Coordinator, Parks And Recreation Project Supervisor, Clerk Of Boards, Emergency Management Technician, Police Accreditation Manager, Grants Management Specialist, Rapid Response Team And Excellence Program Assessor; Reclassifying From Development Coordinator To Marketing, Tourism And Development Manager; Grants Manager To Grants Officer, From City Surveyor To City Surveyor Manager, Chief Protection Analyst To Fire Protection Analyst Section Manager, From Streets, Lighting And Stormwater Superintendent To Stormwater Superintendent, Parks Superintendent To Greenspace Superintendent, From Procurement Coordinator To Procurement Contracting Officers I And II, Senior Procurement Specialist To Procurement Contracting Officer III And From Leasing Specialist To Real Estate Asset Specialist; Deleting The Following Obsolete Classifications: Affirmative Action Officer, Assistant Director-Neighborhood Services, Development And MBTV Director, Structural Engineer, Employment Supervisor, Historic Preservation Coordinator, PSCU Administrator, Quality Assurance Manager, Quality Assurance Officer, Quality Assurance Coordinator, Senior Business Manager, Housing Manager, Neighborhood Services Projects Administrator, Project Planner/Designer, Public Safety Communications Unit Director, Senior Code Compliance Administrator, Implementation Services Manager, Special Events Liaison, Police Public Information Officer, Elder Affairs Coordinator, Grants Manager, Development Coordinator And Grants Specialist, Requiring That The City Commission Be Informed Whenever An Unclassified Employee Is Hired At An Annual Salary Of \$150,000 Or More; And Providing For Repealer, Severability, And An Effective Date. **First Reading**

(Sponsored by Commissioner Michael Grieco)

(Legislative Tracking: Human Resources)

ACTION: Ordinance adopted on first reading as amended. Title of the Ordinance read into the record. Motion made by Commissioner Wolfson, seconded by Vice-Mayor Tobin; Ballot vote: 5-1; Opposed: Commissioner Weithorn; Absent: Mayor Levine. Second Reading Public Hearing scheduled for **September 30, 2015 at 5:04 p.m.** Rafael E. Granado to notice. Lilia Cardillo to place on the Commission Agenda if received. **Sylvia Crespo-Tabak to handle.**

Amendments:

Notify City Commission if hiring staff with salaries over \$75,000.

Reflect the adjusted pay range for Senior Auditor and Assistant Internal Auditor.

Motion No. 1 on the amendments

Motion made by Vice-Mayor Tobin; seconded by Commissioner Grieco; Ballot vote: 5-1; Opposed: Commissioner Malakoff; Absent: Mayor Levine.

Motion No. 2 on the Ordinance as amended

Motion made by Commissioner Wolfson; seconded by Vice-Mayor Tobin; Ballot vote: 5-1; Opposed: Commissioner Weithorn. Absent: Mayor Levine.

Sylvia Crespo-Tabak, Human Resources Director, explained that throughout the year she has been keeping track of new positions, and those that are no longer used. They are trying to clean the salary plan to show only the classifications they are using. She gave the example of Affirmative Action Officer, which is no longer used, so there is no need to keep an Affirmative Action Officer on the pay plan. She added that despite taking great care, she was unable to avoid one mistake, and asked that the title be revised for second reading to reflect the pay range for Senior Auditor and Assistant Internal Auditor, which were also adjusted.

City Manager Morales clarified that the job classification Ordinance reflects positions that have been created, reclassified or eliminated.

Commissioner Weithorn asked where in the budget does it show which are the new positions.

Sylvia Crespo-Tabak, Human Resources Director, explained that titles underlined are new positions.

City Manager Morales stated that between first and second reading, the Administration would provide a list of the new positions. **Sylvia Crespo-Tabak to handle.**

Commissioner Weithorn stated that she is unhappy with the bloating of the budget; therefore, she cannot support the budget, because of the way the City is spending money.

Discussion held.

Vice-Mayor Tobin asked who is the new Parks and Recreation Coordinator.

John Rebar, Parks and Recreation Department Director, replied to Vice-Mayor Tobin that that position was reclassified from Landscape Park Coordinator to Parks Project Coordinator. John Toledo from Property Management was hired for that job.

Ms. Crespo-Tabak stated that Green Space is a new subdivision of Parks and Recreation, and Public Works. Although it is a new subdivision, that does not mean that additional personnel were hired.

Vice-Mayor Tobin explained to the public that Unclassified jobs are not Union jobs, and many times people get these positions based on whom they know. When Unclassified positions grow in the City, it is up to the elected officials to look and question the need for these new hirings. He stated, for instance, the four extra staffers who were hired in the Mayor and Commissioners' Office, which he is currently looking into.

Ms. Crespo-Tabak stated that the Capital Projects Director Convention Center District is a new position to more accurately reflect the work Maria Hernandez is doing. She also gave the example of the Assistant Management Director from PSCU; that person was hired as the PSCU Director, but the title was eliminated to reflect the position more accurately.

Vice-Mayor Tobin asked about the classification and documentation of the Mayor's driver.

City Manager Morales explained that the Mayor on occasion requests the assistance of a driver, who is a contracted employee paid for by the City's Security Guard Funds.

Vice-Mayor Tobin recalled the \$80,000 to \$90,000 miscellaneous transportation costs that were discussed during the City Commission Retreat.

John Woodruff, Budget and Improvement Performance Director, replied that this item was related to the Security budget, which the City Commission approved during the City Commission Retreat.

Vice-Mayor Tobin stated that it is important that the public is informed of these costs, and they should be explained in the budget. He asked about the Mayor's Public Relations Office.

Discussion held.

City Manager Morales explained that the PIO position in the Mayor's Office was budgeted out of the Communications Department.

Vice-Mayor Tobin suggested that rather than continuing to increase expenses in the Mayor's Office, a budget should be set aside of approximately \$200,000 and work with that. He stated that although he likes everyone in the Mayor's Office, there are four new positions created that did not exist before, and he questioned their necessity. The costs will be in the hundreds of thousands of dollars, and he does not believe they need that much in public relations.

Commissioner Weithorn added that the expenses in the Mayor's Office are up approximately \$400,000 from previous years.

Discussion held.

Ms. Crespo-Tabak stated that the classifications used show the pay grade at which they have been assigned. On the Second Budget Meeting scheduled on September 30, she will return with a report that will show when a position is eliminated to help fund another position. **Sylvia Crespo-Tabak to handle.**

City Manager Morales suggested creating an annotated chart that shows both the new positions and the reclassified positions.

Vice-Mayor Tobin requested that the City Commission be notified when an employee is hired for \$150,000 or more. He also asked if the City Commission could be notified when an employee is hired for \$100,000 or more.

Discussion continued.

Vice-Mayor Tobin made a motion for the City Commission to be notified when someone has been hired for \$100,000 or more.

Commissioner Grieco asked for more clarification on who currently informs the City Commission when someone is hired for \$150,000 salary or more.

Ms. Crespo-Tabak stated that the City Manager makes salary decisions and notifies the Commission. Ms. Crespo-Tabak noted that since the \$150,000 threshold was created, only one

person has been hired with that salary. She is currently drafting a memorandum to the City Manager to review the proposed Assistant City Manager's position, whose salary will be over \$150,000 a year.

Commissioner Grieco proposed amending the motion to notice the City Commission when hiring for a position of \$75,000 or above a year.

Raul J. Aguila, City Attorney, clarified that the notice can be changed to inform the City Commission whenever an Unclassified employee has been hired at an annual salary of \$75,000 or more.

Vice-Mayor Tobin agreed with Commissioner Grieco's amendment to be notified at \$75,000. Moved and seconded by Commissioner Grieco; Ballot vote: 5-1; Opposed: Commissioner Malakoff. Absent: Mayor Levine.

Commissioner Malakoff stated that this is a strong City Manager Government, and she does not want to take power away from the City Manager if the City Commission has to approve his hirings.

Discussion held.

Motion made by Commissioner Wolfson to approve the Ordinance as amended, seconded by Commissioner Tobin; Ballot vote: 5-1; Opposed: Commissioner Weithorn; Absent: Mayor Levine.

5:35:51 p.m.

R5B An Ordinance Amending The Code Of The City Of Miami Beach, By Amending Chapter 106, Entitled "Traffic And Vehicles," By Amending Article II, Entitled "Metered Parking," By Amending Division 1, Entitled "Generally," By Amending Section 106-55, Entitled "Parking Rates, Fees, And Penalties;" By Amending Parking Meter Rates And Time Limits; Municipal Parking Garage And Preferred Parking Lot Rates And Penalties; Regulations Regarding A Facility Specific Monthly Parking Permit Program, Reserved/Restricted Commercial On-Street Permit Parking, And Valet Storage Spaces; And Amending The Regulations And Fees For Metered Parking Space Rental And Parking Space Removal; Amending The Regulations Regarding The Residential Parking Program; Amending The Exceptions To Section 106-55 To Provide For A Mobile Phone Payment Service And Eliminating The Smart Card Program; And Establishing A Residential Parking Visitor Permit; Providing For Codification, Repealer, Severability, And An Effective Date. **First Reading**
(Sponsored by Commissioner Deede Weithorn)
(Legislative Tracking: Parking)

ACTION: Ordinance adopted on first reading as amended. Title of the Ordinance read into the record. See ballots for each amendment. Second Reading Public Hearing scheduled for **September 30, 2015 at 5:05 p.m.** Rafael E. Granado to notice. Lilia Cardillo to place on the Commission Agenda if received. **Saul Frances to handle.**

AMENDMENTS:

- **Valet Permits**

Valet permits increase from \$17 to \$25 immediately, with an increase to \$31.50 in six months and revisit in the next budget meeting; motion made by Commissioner Grieco; seconded by Commissioner Wolfson; Ballot vote: 6-0. Absent: Mayor Levine.

- **Construction and Permitted Events**

Construction and Special Events permits increase from \$10 to \$25, but locked in at current rate if they are permitted for the next six months, motion by Commissioner Grieco, seconded by Commissioner Weithorn; Ballot vote: 6-0. Absent: Mayor Levine.

- **Special Events**

Any Special Event application will be locked in at \$10 for the next six months; otherwise, they will go up \$25 a meter, excluding non-profits; motion by Commissioner Grieco; seconded by Vice-Mayor Tobin; Ballot vote: 6-0; Absent: Mayor Levine.

- **South Beach On-Street Parking**

Increasing the rate of on street metered parking in South Beach (South of 23rd Street) from \$3 to \$4 an hour. Parking from 23rd to 44th Street will remain \$3 an hour. Motion made by Commissioner Malakoff; seconded by Commissioner Weithorn; ballot vote: 6-0; Absent Mayor Levine.

Jimmy L. Morales, City Manager, stated that there were two discussions throughout the year, one to establish priorities for Transportation, and they discussed the use of parking rates in a more dynamic way to try to influence traffic patterns to disincentivize the use of cars, and also expand investment particularly with the trolleys system; this item deals with the funding for these items.

Commissioner Weithorn stated that she sponsored the item because the City needs to disincentivize people from using on-street parking, as it disrupts traffic. Up to 40% of traffic comes from people circling looking for parking spaces. There has been controversy on some of the valet spaces and parking in general, people will come to Miami Beach by car, because parking is so cheap. In discussing this with Saul Frances, the residential parking rate will not increase; this is important because this is geared to the visitors. Secondly, the City has approximately \$8.5 million per year coming from the parking funds, and if they used a portion of that \$8.5 million, parking rates would not need to be increased; however, she believes there needs to be an increase on street parking to disincentivize this behavior.

Commissioner Malakoff suggested raising the parking meter rate. They need to give incentives for people to park in the garages and notify people that garages cost less than metered parking. She suggested the South Beach on street meters be increased to \$4 per hour instead of \$3, because they have to stop people from circling the block and creating more traffic. She agrees with Commissioner Weithorn. The municipal garages will be an incentive for people to park there, only if metered parking rates are higher than the garages.

Vice-Mayor Tobin added that they are increasing on-street parking rates from \$1.75 for non-residents; this should encourage parking in the garages.

Saul Frances, Parking Department Director, stated that it is programmed into the recommendation and transportation options.

Commissioner Steinberg asked if they going to have outreach and education for people to know the garage rates.

Mr. Frances stated this can be done short-term through signage or electronic messaging. **Saul Frances to handle.**

Commissioner Weithorn suggested that they should get the word out, or have the App immediately notify the user that garage parking is cheaper.

Discussion continued.

Vice-Mayor Tobin asked if they can build into the budget more pronounced signs. They have to do a better job to let people know where the garages are.

Commissioner Grieco stated that they just freed \$20 million for the Collins Parking Garage and that is no longer being developed.

Kathie G. Brookes, Assistant City Manager, clarified that the funds for the Collins Parking Garage came from the City Center RDA, not the Parking Fund.

Commissioner Grieco asked if they addressed the increases in valet rates. It is currently \$17 per day per space for valet usage; \$10 for construction usage, special events and Film and TV. There is a proposal to increase all these rates to \$46.75 per day, and that calculation was based upon the 25 cents per square foot for Right-Of-Way permit. He is concerned about valets passing that cost to end user or actual business owners. He suggested increasing to \$31.50, based upon the 18-hour enforceable day, and being \$1.75 for on-street meter rate for residents. He also suggested phasing in the rate increases at first to \$25, then after six months increase it to \$31.50, and then revisit in the charges in the next budget season. This is a significant increase, although no increases have occurred in eight years. He proposed this as an amendment.

Commissioner Malakoff stated that it is important that the Film and TV rental remain the same; she agrees with the same formula as Commissioner Grieco explained, phasing the rates in within six months.

Discussion held.

Commissioner Weithorn suggested increasing valet parking rates immediately to \$31.50 and in six months phase in the increase. Special Events and for anything permitted for Special Events, they should honor the rates for the current calendar year, as it is not fair for business to increase it at this time. Every time they increase the on-street meter, they should increase prices across the board.

Commissioner Grieco suggested discussing further, and he will propose an amendment.

Mitch Novick stated that his construction project would last approximately another 16 months; when he picked up his parking permit, he was told it would increase by 500%. He requested to be grandfathered in.

Commissioner Weithorn stated that they should honor the six-month period for projects underway. There is room for honoring existing projects.

Mr. Frances asked, for clarification, whether issuing building permits should be grandfathered in, or if there is some other mechanism they should use.

Commissioner Weithorn stated that she is willing to grandfather building permits for six months.

Vice-Mayor Tobin explained, for the public, that for \$17, valet operators can reserve metered parking for 24 hours. They are proposing to increase the rate to \$31.50.

Discussion continued regarding complaints received.

Rafael Andrade, Esq., representing Mango's Tropical Café, stated that they have a concern regarding the rate increase and urged the City Commission to cap the rate at \$31.50. This has the potential to be a fatal blow to the valet industry.

Alexander Stojvanovich, representing Special Events, asked if they will keep the rates the same for Film and Print work.

Mr. Frances explained that these rates will not increase.

Discussion continued regarding increase rates from \$10 to \$25.

Dave Cook, representing Miami Beach Gay Pride, stated that their rates to close Ocean Drive will go from \$3,400 to \$16,000 for Gay Pride Week. He asked the City Commission to consider non-profit organizations.

Commissioner Weithorn suggested obtaining a permit, but she is not in the position to pick and choose. For those that have a permit this year, they will let them keep what they have. For next year, they will need to find a different sponsor, or ask the City to waive the fees, on a one by one basis. They are charging less than \$1 an hour.

Discussion continued.

Commissioner Grieco offered the following amendments:

Valet Permits

Valet permits increase from \$17 to \$25 immediately, with an increase to \$31.50 in six months and revisit in the next budget cycle; motion made by Commissioner Grieco; seconded by Commissioner Wolfson; Ballot vote: 6-0. Absent: Mayor Levine.

Construction and Permitted Events

Construction and special events permits increase from \$10 to \$25 but locked in at current rate if they are permitted for the next six months, motion by Commissioner Grieco, seconded by Commissioner Weithorn; Ballot vote: 6-0. Absent: Mayor Levine.

Special Events

Any Special Events application will be locked in at \$10 for the next six months; otherwise, they will go up to \$25 a meter, excluding non for profits; motion by Commissioner Grieco; seconded by Vice-Mayor Tobin; Ballot vote: 6-0; Absent: Mayor Levine.

Commissioner Malakoff added the following amendment:

South Beach On-Street Parking

Increasing the rate of on street metered parking in South Beach (South of 23rd Street) from \$3 to \$4 an hour. Parking from 23rd to 44th Streets will remain \$3 an hour. Motion made by Commissioner Malakoff; seconded by Commissioner Weithorn; ballot vote: 6-0; Absent Mayor Levine.

Discussion held regarding on-street parking on Indian Creek Drive.

Commissioner Steinberg raised the issue of guest parking on Indian Creek Drive, and she does not believe it is fair to have people paying \$4 an hour to park in that area.

Vice-Mayor Tobin stated that people in that area can apply for residential parking.

Mr. Frances stated that there is a residential parking program in the area, and people can use the parking metered spaces on a first-come first-serve basis, without having to feed the meters.

Commissioner Malakoff suggested going with the recommendation to leave on street metered parking at \$3 an hour from 23rd to 44th Streets.

6:10:28 p.m.

SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIAL 1: ORDINANCE

R5C An Ordinance Amending Appendix A, Entitled "Fee Schedule," To Chapter 110 Of The Miami Beach City Code, Entitled "Utilities," Article IV, Entitled "Fees, Charges, Rates And Billing Procedure," Division 2, Entitled "Rates, Fees And Charges," Section 110-166, Entitled "Schedule Of Water Rates And Tapping Charges," And Section 110-168, Entitled "Sanitary Sewer Service Charge," To Increase The Rate For Water Service Charges In Excess Of The Minimum Service Charge; And To Increase The Sanitary Sewer Service Charge By The Same Percentage Enacted By Miami-Dade Water And Sewer Department (WASD) Pursuant To Section 110-168; Providing For Codification, Repealer, Severability, And An Effective Date. **First Reading**
(Sponsored by Commissioner Jonah Wolfson)
(Legislative Tracking: Public Works)

ACTION: Ordinance adopted on first reading. Title of the Ordinance read into the record. Motion made by Commissioner Wolfson, seconded by Commissioner Malakoff to approve the Ordinance. Ballot vote: 5-1; Opposed: Commissioner Weithorn. Absent: Mayor Levine. Second Reading Public Hearing scheduled for **September 30, 2015 at 5:06 p.m.** Rafael E. Granado to notice. Lilia Cardillo to place on the Commission Agenda if received. **Eric Carpenter to handle.**

Eric Carpenter, Assistant City Manager and Public Works Director, stated that there are two discussions: 1) the sewer rate – Miami-Dade County increased the sewer rates by 8.9%, and they are suggesting increasing the City's rate by that percentage, consistent with the Code; 2) the water rates were lowered by Miami-Dade County, and even though the County's maintenance costs have increased, the overall rates are proposed to be lower at two percent 2% for next year. They are recommending increasing water rates by 5%; they can cover operation and maintenance costs at the existing rate, but they need additional revenue to cover debt service for anticipated capital improvements to undertake next year as part of neighborhood improvement projects, since construction costs have gone up.

Discussion held.

Mr. Carpenter introduced Deborah Swain from Milian, Swain & Associates to explain the need these rates increases.

Vice-Mayor Tobin stated that the City can do a better job. The City at times pays a contractor for additional scope, and that work is not bid out; he stated again that the City needs someone who understands costs and pricing in detail. He requested to see what the legacy costs are.

Mr. Carpenter clarified that the following discussion is strictly for the water rates, he does not want to confuse the discussion with the sewer rates. He stated that it is important that the City looks into the critical water conveyance structures that are more than 80 years old, which need to be addressed.

Deborah Swain, Rate Consultant for the City, Milian, Swain & Associates, showed a PowerPoint presentation.

Discussion held.

Vice-Mayor Tobin asked, for clarification, on the 5% water increase, if it will be as simple as residents paying 5% more on the water bills they are paying now.

Mr. Carpenter answered that the rate increase will in fact be a matter of charging 5% more on residents' water bills.

Commissioner Malakoff stated that she believes the increase is acceptable, because in the last five years, the water rate has only increased by 1.5%.

Commissioner Weithorn stated that she has not received historical documents to justify the increase, and is not in support of the increase. She mentioned that on page 346 of the agenda, the numbers show that the water purchases are going down and debt services are going up. She asked how they could find \$1 million to offset that. She needs to understand where they spent capital on and she needs rates.

Vice-Mayor Tobin asked Mr. Carpenter to bring the details requested by Commissioner Weithorn between first and second reading. **Eric Carpenter to handle.**

Commissioner Steinberg stated that she is hesitant to approve the 5% water rate increase because last year the rate had gone up 1.5%.

Discussion continued.

Commissioner Wolfson stated that this rate increase is to help fund the infrastructure repair that is needed for the City's old pipes.

Mitch Novick, Miami Beach resident and small business owner, stated that he had been spending approximately \$1,000 a month on water-based expenses, but last October that rate went up \$400, which is a substantial increase, while consumption remained the same. This increase will affect businesses.

Mr. Carpenter stated that he believes Mr. Novick was referring to the combined water and sewer invoice, as there was a substantial rate increase last year passed through from the County on the sewer side, and that is why his expenses were so high.

Discussion held regarding rate increases and other cost increases.

Commissioner Weithorn explained that the City is passing along the operating cost the County is giving the City, and the City has its own operating cost, so the City is raising the same percentage; the County sewer treatment is going up about \$4 million per year; the entire budget is actually going up a little less; but yet the debt service is going down.

Mr. Carpenter explained that the City does not have to pick up the debt service on the debt they are issuing this fiscal year because of the timing of the issuance.

Discussion continued regarding operating expenses.

Mr. Carpenter explained that the County's fees included treatment and a 7.5% DERM fee on whatever the City is paying on treatment, which is an addition to the increase.

Vice-Mayor Tobin stated that Public Works is one of the departments whose budget did not grow, and he recognized Mr. Carpenter for managing this. He also recognized Mr. Carpenter for his promotion to Assistant City Manager.

Motion was reinstated by Rafael E. Granado, City Clerk. Ballot vote taken.

Motion made by Commissioner Wolfson, seconded by Commissioner Malakoff to approve the Ordinance. Ballot vote: 5-1; Opposed: Commissioner Weithorn. Absent: Mayor Levine.

6:31:45 p.m.

Commissioner Steinberg stated that Steve Adkins, Miami-Dade Gay and Lesbian Chamber of Commerce, had submitted an email requesting to add a line item of \$25,000 for a contribution for his organization.

Vice-Mayor Tobin suggested bringing the item back at a later point.

Steve Adkins explained they are requesting \$25,000.

Raul J. Aguila, City Attorney, stated that Mr. Adkins's request can be appropriately discussed with item R7A2.

Resolutions

6:33:53 p.m.

R7A1 A Resolution Adopting: 1) The Tentative Ad Valorem Millage Of 5.7092 Mills For General Operating Purposes, Which Is Twelve And Nine-Tenths Percent (12.9%) More Than The "Rolled-Back" Rate Of 5.0584 Mills; And 2) The Debt Service Millage Rate Of 0.2031 Mills; Further Setting The Second Public Hearing To Consider The Millage Rate For Fiscal Year (FY) 2015/16, On Wednesday, September 30, 2015 At 5:01 p.m. **5:01 p.m. First Reading Public Hearing**
(Budget & Performance Improvement)

ACTION: Title of the Resolution read into the record. Public hearing held. **Resolution No. 2015-29134 adopted.** Commissioner Grieco recommended voting on the millage and moved the item, seconded by Commissioner Wolfson. Voice vote: 5-1; Opposed: Commissioner Weithorn; Absent: Mayor Levine. Second Reading Public Hearing scheduled for **September 30, 2015 at 5:01 p.m.** Rafael E. Granado to notice. Lilia Cardillo to place on the Commission Agenda, if received. **John Woodruff to handle.**

DIRECTION:

- Hold a City Commission Sunshine Meeting on **September 16, 2015 at 3:00 p.m.** in the Commission Chambers to further discuss
- Lower millage between first and second reading, if possible
- The Office of Community Services did not receive increases – change part-time positions into full-time positions, possibly funded by Resort Tax
- Recommended changes to be provided to Administration

John Woodruff, Budget & Performance Improvement Director, summarized the budget by informing that property values increased 13.3% Citywide, and 15.2% in the City Center RDA, so the City is going through a boom. The City Commission voted to reduce the millage rate 0.1114 mills to meet the remaining millage rate goal to the level of FY 2010, as property values have raised over the last five years. The impact of that millage rate reduction to homesteaded properties would be a

reduction in the City's property taxes, for a medium property owner of \$10 and for an average property owner of \$23.

Discussion held regarding property value increase of \$50 million.

Mr. Woodruff added that the proposed property tax levy is only \$4 million more now than it was nine years ago. The overall position count is still 2.9% less than it was nine years ago. As part of the annual review, programs and services in the budget efficiencies were identified totaling \$1.2 million. While they are rolling back the rate and lowering property taxes for City residents, they also added enhancements to address several strategic priorities, such as:

- ✓ Improving traffic and mobility by adding an additional Police Motor Unit
- ✓ Expanding the freight loading zone program Citywide
- ✓ Increasing public safety by supporting the Human Trafficking Task Force
- ✓ Implementing a License Plate Reader System on MacArthur Causeway
- ✓ Improving Police culture by reimbursing ten Police recruits to complete training, instead of hiring certified officers with previous experience
- ✓ Funding 50 additional body worn cameras
- ✓ Enhancing beautification by creating an Urban Forest Tree Preservation Program and developing a GIS Tree Inventory
- ✓ Enhancing programming for various recreational programs
- ✓ Help preserve infrastructure by increasing the Pay As You Go funding from the General Fund to Capital Projects by \$1 million dollars from \$1.4 million, to \$2.4 million
- ✓ Increasing response times for addressing high priority citizen issues, by providing two part-time positions to the newly created Rapid Response Team
- ✓ Enhancing a more proactive Code and Compliance environment by adding three Code Compliance Officers in the Entertainment District to augment the existing two positions added in FY 15. This enhancement was changed after the July 17 Finance & Citywide Projects Committee meeting held
- ✓ Expanding the "Can On Every Corner" initiative by an additional 100 locations
- ✓ Expanding the trolley system
- ✓ Adding six new lifeguard stands to the existing 29 locations
- ✓ Enhancing parking lot cleanliness

Discussion held.

Commissioners Malakoff and Wolfson recognized Mr. Woodruff for a great job done with the budget.

Discussion continued.

Commissioner Weithorn will not support today's budget, as she believes the budget is "bloated" and government has gotten too big; this is the biggest budget she has seen since she was elected to office eight years ago. She put together cuts of approximately \$8 million, which she proposed can go back to the parking fund, or given as checks to residents, as former Mayor Dermer did. She highlighted the fact that some departments have grown 100% and even 400% in the past four years, while other departments have only grown 5% in comparison. She believes the budget is unsustainable, and the money being spent is not making Miami Beach cleaner or safer.

Vice-Mayor Tobin stated that there are some departments worth looking at regarding their large budgets.

Discussion held regarding created departments, including the Emergency Department.

Mr. Woodruff stated that the Emergency Department has a large budget, because 911/Communications is part of it, and most of the money goes to fund that service.

Vice-Mayor Tobin stated that some departments seem to have had a substantial increase. He mentioned the Communications Department's budget, which has increased 121%, and proposed holding a discussion about it.

Commissioner Wolfson stated that the City Commission had a process and went line by line on each budget item; there was a time during that process to bring things up, and he questioned why Commissioner Weithorn did not state her concerns during that time. He suggested Commissioner Weithorn provide a memorandum with the changes she is asking for. He believes the City has been doing its job in addressing issues, and listed the efforts being made in fixing traffic problems, increasing funds for the Parking Department, implementing the trolley system, adding more motormen to the streets, and adding more lifeguard stands.

Commissioner Weithorn explained that she did not raise her concerns earlier because the data was not available to her. One of the main things she is against is spending \$750,000 to renovate the Commission Chambers. She also questioned the increase in positions in the Office of Communications.

Mr. Woodruff stated that regarding the Commission Chambers' renovation, there was \$150,000 that was budgeted during last year's process. The additional funds were proposed for a more comprehensive change to the Chambers.

Discussion held regarding renovation of the Commission Chambers.

Jimmy L. Morales, City Manager, stated that in November there will be significant work done to the Audio/Visual equipment in the Commission Chambers.

Commissioner Grieco stated that the City Commission had gone through the whole budget during the summer process and it was voted on with a full dais. He understands if a few items need to be highlighted, but he does not see the need to go through the entire budget during this meeting. He added that they are in a boom time, and he believes the City is doing the right thing in lowering taxes and providing more services to the residents.

Vice-Mayor Tobin reiterated that the budget for Public Relations has gone up \$1 million, and the Mayor's Office staff has increased significantly. He believes it may be worthwhile reviewing some departments.

Commissioner Grieco moved the item; Commissioner Wolfson seconded the motion.

Vice-Mayor Tobin asked Commissioner Grieco whether he would be interested in holding an additional meeting between this meeting and the Second Budget Hearing on September 30, 2015.

Commissioner Grieco agreed that he would be interested in holding a special "Sunshine" meeting to discuss certain budget items.

Discussion held on the nomenclature of the meeting, whether it will be a Sunshine meeting or a Workshop.

Commissioner Weithorn mentioned that the Office of Community Services needs more funds. They currently have two part-time positions, which should be made into full-time positions, and possibly the Resort Tax could cover the costs.

City Manager Morales stated that his staff could work on lowering the millage rate between this meeting and second reading meeting.

Vice-Mayor Tobin requested an additional meeting to take place on September 16, 2015 at 3 p.m. in the City Commission Chambers to further discuss budget and other policy items.

6:59:53 p.m.

R7A2 A Resolution Adopting Tentative Budgets For The General, G.O. Debt Service, RDA Ad Valorem Taxes, Enterprise, Internal Service, And Special Revenue Funds For Fiscal Year 2015/16 Subject To A Second Public Hearing Scheduled On Wednesday, September 30, 2015 At 5:01 p.m. **5:01 p.m. First Reading Public Hearing**
(Budget & Performance Improvement)

ACTION: Title of the Resolution read into the record. Public hearing held. **Resolution No. 2015-29135 adopted as amended.** Commissioner Wolfson moved the item; seconded by Commissioner Weithorn. Absent: Mayor Levine. Second Reading Public Hearing scheduled for **September 30, 2015 at 5:01 p.m.** Rafael E. Granado to notice. Lilia Cardillo to place on the Commission Agenda, if received. **John Woodruff to handle.**

AMENDMENTS:

- Add line item for \$25,000 to fund Miami-Dade Gay & Lesbian Chamber of Commerce.
- Convert Homeless Outreach part-time positions into full-time positions funded by the City's Resort Tax.
- Place a staffer in high tourist traffic areas determined by the City Commission.

MOTION NO. 1

Motion made by Commissioner Wolfson; seconded by Commissioner Steinberg to add a line item for \$25,000 to fund the Miami-Dade Gay & Lesbian Chamber of Commerce. Voice-vote: 6-0; Absent: Mayor Levine.

MOTION 2

Motion made by Commissioner Wolfson, seconded by Commissioner Weithorn to fund additional Homeless Outreach part-time positions and convert into full-time positions, funded by the City's Resort Tax, and place staff in tourist traffic areas as defined by the City Commission. Voice-vote: 6-0; Absent: Mayor Levine.

John Woodruff, Budget & Performance Improvement Director, introduced the item.

Commissioner Weithorn stated that Miami-Dade County Homeless Trust has a Strike Force funded from various specific sources. She met with John Woodruff, Kathie G. Brooks and City Manager Jimmy L. Morales, and what she is suggesting to convert the two part-time positions into full-time positions to allow the City's Homeless Outreach program to attract better-trained staff, and if they can be placed in the tourists areas, these can be funded by the City's Resort Taxes. She would like to have a program similar to what the County has. Staff would work Ocean Drive, Lincoln Road, Washington Avenue and perhaps Collins Avenue, depending on the homeless outreach need.

Vice-Mayor Tobin asked for an explanation for the increased budget. The General Operating Budget is currently \$300 million, whereas eight years ago when he was first elected, the budget was \$225 million.

Mr. Woodruff stated that there is no quick answer to that question, but if it is something the City Commission wants to talk about during the Sunshine Meeting, he will bring the analysis. **John Woodruff to handle.**

Discussion continued.

Commissioner Wolfson moved to add the Miami-Dade Gay & Lesbian Chamber of Commerce to the budget. Every year they fund the Chambers and other not-for-profits, and this is a Chamber of Commerce that has never been included in the process; it is the right time, it is fair, and the right thing to do. Motion made to fund a line item for \$25,000. Commissioner Steinberg seconded the item. Voice-vote: 6-0; Absent: Mayor Levine.

Commissioner Weithorn is concerned about the VCA funding. The City realigned all of the Convention Center booking policy, but did not require VCA to match what they do with the Convention Center. The VCA receives \$2.6 million, and must align with what the City is doing. She asked the VCA staff if they are working on it.

Grisette Roque, VCA Executive Director, stated they have been working with Max Sklar and the idea is to promote Miami Beach in the broadest way they can. She explained their requirements for room nights, and they have different events and projects that they work with the City. They have aligned policies to match with the City's and are willing to listen to any recommendations.

Commissioner Weithorn requested the VCA to look and change how they do business with their booking policies. **Grisette Roque to handle.**

Discussion continued regarding booking policy.

Peggy Benua, VCA Chair, stated that they have added a North Beach incentive to align with the City's policy, and they revised their film incentive to help filming in Miami Beach taking out State funding. **Max Sklar to handle.**

Discussion continued.

Motion made by Commissioner Wolfson to approve the item as amended to include a line item of \$25,000 to fund the Miami-Dade Gay & Lesbian Chamber of Commerce, and convert part-time positions into full-time positions funded out of Resort Tax in the Homeless Outreach Program, and have staff only in tourist traffic areas as defined by the City Commission; seconded by Commissioner Weithorn. Voice-vote: 6-0; Absent: Mayor Levine.

7:13:44 p.m.

- R7B1 A Resolution Of The Board Of Directors Of The Normandy Shores Local Government Neighborhood Improvement District Adopting The Tentative Ad Valorem Millage Rate Of 1.0093 Mills For Fiscal Year (FY) 2015/16 For The Normandy Shores Local Government District, Which Is One And Four Tenths Percent (1.4%) More Than The "Rolled-Back" Rate Of 0.9956 Mills, Subject To A Second Public Hearing Scheduled On Wednesday, September 30, 2015 At 5:02 p.m. **5:02 p.m. First Reading Public Hearing**
(Budget & Performance Improvement)

ACTION: Title of the Resolution read into the record. Public hearing held. **Resolution No. 2015-29136 adopted.** Motion made by Commissioner Weithorn, seconded by Commissioner Malakoff; Voice-vote: 6-0; Absent: Mayor Levine. Second Reading Public Hearing scheduled for **September 30, 2015 at 5:02 p.m.** Rafael E. Granado to notice. Lilia Cardillo to place on the Commission Agenda, if received. **John Woodruff to handle.**

John Woodruff, Budget & Performance Improvement Director, introduced the item, and stated that the Normandy Shores budget is only \$4,000 more, and the millage rate is reduced.

7:15:23 p.m.

- R7B2 A Resolution Of The Board Of Directors Of The Normandy Shores Local Government Neighborhood Improvement District Adopting The Tentative Operating Budget For Fiscal Year (FY) 2015/16 Subject To A Second Public Hearing Scheduled On Wednesday, September 30, 2015 At 5:02 p.m. **5:02 p.m. First Reading Public Hearing**
(Budget & Performance Improvement)

ACTION: Title of the Resolution read into the record. Public hearing held. **Resolution No. 2015-29137 adopted.** Motion made by Commissioner Weithorn, seconded by Commissioner Malakoff; Voice-vote: 6-0; Absent: Mayor Levine. Second Reading Public Hearing scheduled for **September 30, 2015 at 5:02 p.m.** Rafael E. Granado to notice. Lilia Cardillo to place on the Commission Agenda, if received. **John Woodruff to handle.**

No discussion held.

7:15:56 p.m.

- R7C A Resolution Adopting The Tentative Capital Improvement Plan For Fiscal Years (FY) 2015/16-2019/20 And Adopting The City Of Miami Beach Tentative Capital Budget For (FY) 2015/16 Subject To A Second Public Hearing Scheduled On Wednesday, September 30, 2015 At 5:03 p.m. **5:03 p.m. First Reading Public Hearing**
(Budget & Performance Improvement)

ACTION: Title of the Resolution read into the record. Public hearing held. **Resolution No. 2015-29138 adopted.** Motion made by Commissioner Grieco, seconded by Commissioner Wolfson; Voice-vote: 6-0; Absent: Mayor Levine. Second Reading Public Hearing scheduled for **September 30, 2015 at 5:03 p.m.** Rafael E. Granado to notice. Lilia Cardillo to place on the Commission Agenda, if received. **John Woodruff to handle.**

John Woodruff, Budget & Performance Improvement Director, explained that in this year's capital budget they identified dedicated funding of \$500,000 for pavement and sidewalks from renewal replacement funds, as well as one-time funds of \$695,000 from the local option gas tax, which will allow the City to put money towards pavement. They are increasing pedestrian safety by

implementing crime prevention through environmental design improvement with a Citywide lighting program, totaling \$1.3 million. There are 11 priority seawall projects totaling \$10 million, nine projects recommended by the Mayor's Blue Ribbon Panel in North Beach, and 11 new bicycle lanes projects including painting bike lanes green; continuing to address key storm water projects finally for the Convention Center, which is scheduled to break down in December. In answering Vice-Mayor Tobin, he stated that \$622 million from this budget will go towards the renovation of the Convention Center and RDA related projects.

Discussion held regarding majority votes on the item.

Commissioner Wolfson asked if the Española Way improvements were included in the budget and Mr. Woodruff replied that they are currently included.

Discussion continued.

Commissioner Grieco added that the Española Way improvements were to make it a pedestrian road getting rid of the curb drop and correcting flooding issues.

Vice-Mayor Tobin recognized all staff in the audience and the City Commission appreciates their efforts.

Commissioner Weithorn asked the public to have a safe and healthy Jewish New Year.

Meeting adjourned at 7:22:08 p.m.

End of Agenda